Answers to Exercise 3.2

Initiating Friendly Controversy

1. *Compare the defining features of the debate model, the town hall–meeting model, and the legal model.*

The debate model asks students to take a position on a specific issue and use evidence, logic, and persuasive techniques in order to persuade an audience. Students must also find ways to defeat the arguments the opposition proposes. The town hall meeting does not focus so intently on persuasion. Instead, its purpose is to encourage students to look at an issue from a variety of different perspectives. In addition to learning about how a single issue can affect many different people, the town hall–meeting model also requires students to argue from the point of view of a role that is assumed and may be very different from their own. Finally, the legal model focuses on complex analysis of a text. In addition to analyzing different perspectives, students are required to scrutinize how judicial decisions affect public policy.

2. *What is unique about perspective analysis as compared to other approaches described in this section?*

The focus of the perspective analysis is for a person to identify his or her own perspective and the logic underlying that perspective. Of course, this is similar to the other approaches discussed in the section, each of which has this characteristic to one degree or another. The unique feature of the perspective analysis is that it requires students to examine the underlying logic of their own positions and contrast it with the underlying logic of a differing position. Where some of the other models might require students to argue from an opposing position to that of their own, they do not require students to analyze the logic of an opposing position.